

Online supplement to the article

The labour market participation of recently-arrived immigrant women in Germany

by

Bentley Schieckoff & Claudia Diehl

DOI of this supplement: <https://doi.org/10.20377/jfr-462-544>

DOI of the corresponding article: <https://doi.org/10.20377/jfr-462>

Appendix I - Quantitative studies of migrant labour market integration in Germany (published 2000-early 2020)

Author(s) & year	Title	Data	Dependent variable(s)	Independent variables	Groups in comparison	Gender	Migrant generation	Empirical results
Nadia Granato and Frank Kalter (2001)	Die Persistenz ethnischer Ungleichheit an dem deutschen Arbeitsmarkt	Mikrozensus (1996)	occupational status	level of education, country/region of origin, migrant generation, gender, age	natives vs migrant groups (first or second generation, from Italy, Greece, Spain, Turkey, Yugoslavia, Portugal)	males / females	1st & 2nd	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Lower occupational status of the second generation is especially influenced by educational differences - While some differences disappear between natives and migrant groups after accounting for educational differences, this varies by ethnic group, with Turks remaining the most disadvantaged
Thomas Bauer, Pedro T. Pereira, Michael Vogler and Klaus F. Zimmermann (2002)	Portuguese Migrants in the German Labor Market: Selection and Performance	Employment Statistic Register Sample (1975, 1982, 1986, 1990)	earnings	education level, age, occupational status, firm size, sector	German natives vs Portuguese migrants vs Portuguese natives (non-migrants)	males	1 st	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Portuguese migrants in Germany would earn less than their Portuguese counterparts if they had stayed in Portugal - Portuguese migrants in low-skilled blue collar occupations in German earn more than their German counterparts, indicating better unobserved skills
Frank Kalter and Nadia Granato (2002)	Demographic Change, Educational Expansion and Structural Assimilation of Immigrants: The Case of Germany	Mikrozensus (1970, 1989, 1996)	labour force participation rate, occupational status	age, sex, education level, country/region of origin, migrant generation, years since migration	natives vs. migrant groups (Italy, Portugal, Spain, Greece, Turkey, Yugoslavia)	males / females	1st & 2nd	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Turks are the most dissimilar group to Germans with regards to their labor market outcomes - There is a sharp decrease in differences with Germans from the 1st generation to 2nd generation of migrants
Michaela Kreyenfeld and Dirk Konietzka (2002)	The Performance of Migrants in Occupational Labour Markets: Evidence from Aussiedler in Germany	SOEP (1998)	employment, earnings, occupational status	years of work experience, size of firm, age, children in household, German proficiency, age at migration, level of education, working in trained occupation	natives vs. Ethnic German migrants (separate models)	males	1st	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Ethnic Germans perform substantially worse than natives, earning less and on average having a lower occupational status - Ethnic Germans who are working in their trained occupation receive considerable returns to their foreign educational

								endowments - Both natives and Ethnic Germans are restricted to unskilled jobs if they do not gain access to their trained occupation
Amelie Constant (2004)	Immigrant verses Native Businesswomen: Proclivity and Performance	SOEP (2000)	employment (employed/self-employment/other salaried work/no employment), earnings	years of schooling in Germany, years of schooling abroad, health, German citizenship, home ownership in Germany, parents self-employed, marital status, underage children in household, years since migration, age, sector, firm size, position tenure, country/region of origin	native groups (East German vs West German) vs migrant groups (EU and western industrialised countries, Eastern Europe, other)	females	1st & 2nd	- In general, a business career in paid employment is preferable to self-employment when women are of working age, well educated, healthy and home-owners - Migrant women in the 'other' origin category are more likely not to work than to work in paid employment - East German women earn less than West German women in all types of employment, while European migrants earn slightly more (in 'other' wage work)
Irena Kogan (2004)	Labour Market Careers of Immigrants in Germany and the United Kingdom	SOEP (1995-2000) & British Household Panel Study (1993-1999)	labour market trajectory (employment duration, unemployment duration, frequency of unemployment spells)	country/region of origin, years since migration, age, level of education	natives vs migrant groups (EU/'western industrialised' countries/other) in Germany and UK (separate models)	males	1st	- Long and frequent unemployment spells in both Germany and the UK are responsible for the dissimilarity between immigrant and native employment careers - In Germany, the dissimilarity is driven by differences in human capital, and foreign educational qualifications seem to be highly discounted - Immigrants from 'third countries' have more distant career paths, with more frequent employment transitions than the native born
Irena Kogan (2004)	Last Hired, First Fired? The Unemployment	SOEP (1995-2000)	labour market trajectory	country/region of origin, level of education, work	natives vs migrant groups (guest workers, Ethnic Germans, EU-15 and	males	1st & 2nd	- Long and frequent unemployment spells are particularly an obstacle for

	Dynamics of Male Immigrants in Germany		(employment, unemployment)	experience in Germany/abroad, tenure in current job, current occupation/industry, size of enterprise, labour market status before unemployment, receipt of unemployment benefits, regional unemployment rate	other western countries, non-EU) and first vs. second generation			Turkish guest-workers, Ethnic Germans and third-country migrants - Human capital only partially accounts for immigrants' higher unemployment risk, which is also heavily influenced by job characteristics (occupation, industry, size of enterprise) - More recent immigrant cohorts and second generation immigrants' unemployment dynamics do not differ from those of native Germans
Amelie Constant and Douglas Massey (2005)	Labor market segmentation and the earnings of German guest workers	SOEP (1984-1997)	occupational status, earnings	education in Germany, vocational training in Germany, years of schooling in home country, age, years since migration, German proficiency, gender, marital status, presence of children in household, home ownership, nationality, birthplace, naturalization of children, identification with Germany, remittances sent abroad	natives vs. guest-worker groups (European/Turk/Yugoslav)	males / females	1st	- There is a high degree of initial occupational segregation for immigrants, with little job mobility over time (possibly due to discrimination) - Immigrants achieve lower rates of return to technical/vocational training than natives, but other wage returns are greater, yielding significant earnings mobility over time
Holger Seibert and Heike Solga (2005)	Gleiche Chancen dank einer abgeschlossenen Ausbildung? Zum Signalwert von Ausbildungsabschlüssen bei ausländischen und deutschen jungen Erwachsenen	Mikrozensus (1989, 1991, 1993, 1995, 2000)	employment, occupational status	level of education, country/region of origin, time of survey	natives vs migrant groups (Turkey, other guest-worker countries, western industrialised countries, other), separate models for men and women	males / females	1st	- Turkish women have the lowest probability of employment in comparison to native women (though the significance of this effect disappears once education is controlled for) - Foreign women who have completed a vocational training are just as likely to

								find employment as German women who have completed vocational training - Turkish women have much lower odds than German women of occupying a highly-qualified position, but only for the ones that completed their vocational training outside of German (those educated in Germany don't differ from natives)
Amelie Constant and Klaus F. Zimmermann (2006)	The Making of Entrepreneurs in Germany: Are Native Men and Immigrants Alike?	SOEP (2000)	self-employment, earnings	years since migration, pre- and post-migration education, German proficiency, health, marital status, young children in household, country/region of origin, citizenship, regional labour market situation, feelings of discrimination	natives vs migrants groups (Turkey, Italy, ethnic Germans, other)	males	1st & 2nd	- The likelihood of self-employment is not significantly affected by exposure to Germany or by human capital - Migrants are pushed into self-employment if they feel discriminated against - Accounting for other factors, the earnings of self-employed migrants are not significantly different from comparable self-employed natives
Amelie Constant, Liliya Gataullina and Klaus Zimmermann (2006)	Gender, Ethnic Identity and Work	SOEP (2000-2002)	employment rate	age at entry, religion, level of education in home country, educational attainment in Germany, living in a large city, marital status, presence of children in the household, years since migration, ethnic identity index (including knowledge of German/language of the home country, media consumption, social networks and identification with	only migrants (separate models for males, females) accounting for home country (Greece, Italy, Spain, Yugoslavia, Turkey)	males / females	1st	- Male immigrants' success in the German labour market is strongly determined by post- rather than pre-migration characteristics (vocational training in Germany), while female immigrants' success is determined largely by their pre-migration and family characteristics (children in household) - Integration in Germany has a stronger effect on the probability to work for females than males

				Germany/home country)				
Alicia Adsera and Barry R. Chiswick (2007)	Are there gender and country of origin differences in immigrant labor market outcomes across European destinations?	European Community Household Panel (1994-2000)	earnings	marital status, number of children, level of education, work experience, migrant (yes/no), years since migration, country/region of origin, native language, destination country	natives vs migrants, cross-country comparison (various European countries, including Germany), separate models for males/females	males / females	1st	- Migrants in Germany have a relatively small earnings disadvantage relative to natives, compared to migrants in other EU countries - The immigrant-native earnings gap narrows with duration in the destination and is closed after about 18 years
Amelie Constant, Yochanan Shachmurove, and Klaus F. Zimmermann (2007)	What Makes an Entrepreneur and Does it Pay? Native Men, Turks, and Other Migrants in Germany	SOEP (2000)	self-employment, earnings	years of education abroad, years of education in Germany, years since migration, health, willingness to stay in Germany, feeling of belonging in Germany, place of birth, marital status, age, country/region of origin	West German natives vs. migrant groups (Turkey, other)	males	1st & 2nd	- There are hints of an ethnic entrepreneurial spirit, with Turks 70% more likely to be self-employed than other immigrant groups - Migrants start with a higher probability to be self-employed than natives, but have a slower increase thereafter - Self-employed migrants' earnings are initially higher than natives, but natives overtake them with time
Michael Fertig and Stefanie Schurer (2007)	Labour Market Outcomes of Immigrants in Germany - The Importance of Heterogeneity and Attrition Bias	SOEP (1984-2004)	earnings, unemployment	country/region of origin, years of residence, marital status, number of children, disability status, age, type of secondary education/vocational training	natives vs migrant groups (Ethnic Germans, guest-worker cohorts 1955-2002)	males	1st	- Ethnic Germans and recent cohort (1988-2002) show considerable earnings assimilation as time spend in Germany increases (catch up rate to native Germans is about 10 years) - Controlling for human capital explains a large share of initial earnings differences between natives and some migrant groups - Ethnic Germans are only group whose unemployment risk converges with that of natives over time - all other groups experience

								consistently higher unemployment risk
Irena Kogan (2007)	A study of immigrants' employment careers in West Germany using the sequence analysis technique	SOEP (1995-2000)	labour market trajectory (employment, unemployment, occupational status)	country/region of origin, age, level of education	natives vs migrant groups (Ethnic Germans, Turkish guest workers, other guest workers, EU immigrants, third-country immigrants) and first generation vs. second generation migrants	males	1st & 2nd	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Ethnic Germans and EU-15 migrants have the closest career paths to natives - Turkish immigrants are more likely to be long-term unemployed and to be pushed into unskilled occupations - Foreign education endowments are discounted in the German labor market, so all migrant groups have a higher probability of entering unskilled and mobile industries - Second generation immigrants do not completely catch up to natives in terms of occupational status, influenced by lower educational attainment than natives
Anja Stichs (2008)	Arbeitsmarktintegration von Frauen ausländischer Nationalität in Deutschland	Repräsentativbefragung ausgewählter Migrantengruppen (RAM) 2006/2007	labour force participation, employment	age, country/region of origin, years since arrival, migrant generation, family status, number and age of children, migration motive, German proficiency, level of education	migrant group comparison (Turkey, Greece, Italy, Spain, Poland, former Yugoslavia)	females	1st & 2nd	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Turkish women are less likely to participate in the labor force than women from other countries of origin with the same initial characteristics - Migrant women with German education credentials (or German-recognized credentials from abroad) are better integrated into the labor market than those who do not have these qualifications - First generation Polish women are better integrated in the labor market than those women from former labor recruitment countries,

								mostly because they have better German proficiency and higher educational qualifications
Leilanie Basilio, Thomas K. Bauer and Mathias Sinning (2009)	Analyzing the labor market activity of immigrant families in Germany	SOEP (1984-2005)	labour supply, wage assimilation	migration order (concurrent, sequential), migrant cohort, age, years of education, German language proficiency, region of residence in Germany, country of birth, number of children living in the household, presence of children under seven years old	migrants vs natives, female migrants who migrated with their partner vs those who followed their partner, separate analyses for men and women	males / females	1st	- Both immigrant husbands and wives work less after migrating than natives - The labor supply of female migrant wives assimilates to that of comparable natives irrespective if they arrive with their husbands or join them later
Amelie Constant (2009)	Businesswomen in Germany and their performance by ethnicity	SOEP (2002)	employment (employed/self-employment/other salaried work/no employment), earnings	years of schooling in Germany, years of schooling abroad, vocational training, health, years since migration, age, family status, country/region of origin, German citizenship, firm size, firm age, industry, occupational status, labour market tightness	native groups (East German vs West German) vs migrant groups (EU and western industrialised countries, Eastern Europe, other)	females	1st & 2nd	- Wages initially differ between migrant/native groups, but after accounting for human capital and firm characteristics, there is no significant difference left between the groups
Yann Algan, Christian Dustmann and Albrecht Glitz (2010)	The economic situation of first and second generation immigrants in France, Germany and the United Kingdom	Mikrozensus (2005, 2006)	earnings, employment	country/region of origin, age left full-time education, work experience, region	natives vs migrant groups (first or second generation), separate models for men/women	males / females	1st & 2nd	- Pay gap between migrant and native women for most ethnic groups mirrors the pay gap for migrant and native men - Only few groups of second generation immigrants improve their earnings, and overall wage assimilation is weak - First generation immigrant women fare worst relative to native employment compared to immigrant men, though second generation

								improve their employment rates
Rob Euwals, Jaco Dagevos, Merove Gijsberts, Hans Roodenburg (2010)	Citizenship and Labor Market Position: Turkish Immigrants in Germany and the Netherlands	SOEP (2002)	employment rate, tenured job rate, job prestige	naturalisation, age, number of children, level of education, migration channel, language proficiency	cross-country comparison (Germany vs the Netherlands)	males / females	1st & 2nd	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - There is no relationship found between naturalization and employment in Germany - There is evidence of a negative relationship between naturalization and tenured employment rate in Germany - There is a clear, positive relationship between naturalization and job status
Jutta Höhne and Ruud Koopmans (2010)	Host-country cultural capital and labour market trajectories of migrants in Germany	SOEP (1988-2006)	employment, unemployment duration	country/region of origin, local unemployment rate, share of low qualified workers in Germany, repeated spells of unemployment, number of children in household, educational level, handicapped, German proficiency, visits with Germans, married, migrant generation, religious observance, newspaper preferences, German citizenship	natives vs migrant groups (Turkey, Yugoslavia, Greece, Spain, Italy), separate models for males and females	males / females	1st	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Host-country related human and social capital increases chances of both male and female migrants of finding a job - Strong Muslim religiosity decreases the chances of finding a job for both male and female migrants - For married women, the husband's characteristics (language proficiency and interethnic friends) influence the wife's chances of finding a job, while strong religiosity (both Christians and Muslims) reduces the chance of transition out of home work - Reading exclusively ethnic newspapers leads to shorter employment durations for men and women - Ethnic group differences remain even after accounting for factors in models, with migrants from Turkey having the lowest outcomes
Irena Kogan (2010)	New Immigrants - Old Disadvantage Patterns?	Mikrozensus (1996, 2000, 2005)	labour market trajectory	level of education, marital status,	natives vs. migrant groups (EU-15, other western	males / females	1st	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - More recent cohorts are more ambitious and more

	Labour Market Integration of Recent Immigrants into Germany		(avoidance of unemployment and inactivity, occupational status)	dependent children, age, years since migration, year of survey, region of residence	industrialised countries, rest of world, Ethnic Germans) and wider range of countries			successful at entering higher status occupations - Western immigrants have better labor market outcomes than non-Western
Agnieszka Kanas, Frank van Tubergen and Tanja Van der Lippe (2011)	The role of social contacts in the employment status of immigrants	SOEP (1984-2004)	employment	frequency of contacts, volunteering activity, contacts with Germans, education in Germany, German language proficiency, education level in home country, work experience in home country, doctor visits, gender, marital status, presence of children in the household, years since migration, country/region of origin, survey year, region of residence	migrant group comparison (Turkey, Greece, Yugoslavia, Italy, Spain, Eastern Europe, other country), separate models male/female	males / females	1st	- Social contacts with family, friends and neighbours have no significant effect on employment for either male or female immigrants - Contacts with native Germans increases the likelihood of employment, and this effect operates the same way for male and female migrants - Turks are more often unemployed than other ethnic groups
Irena Kogan (2011)	The price of being an outsider: Labour market flexibility and immigrants' employment paths in Germany	Mikrozensus (1996-1999, 2001-2004)	unemployment probability, probability of being employed on a fixed-term contract	level of education, marital status, dependent children, age, years since migration, region of residence	natives vs. migrant ethnic-cohort groups (EU-15, US/Canada/Australia/New Zealand, rest of world) arriving pre-1990 and post-1990 (more detailed country of origin analysis also conducted)	males	1st	- Migrants experience more frequent mobility in and out of unemployment - Fixed-term employment is especially pronounced among recent, non-EU migrants immigrants and natives share similar risks of losing fixed-term employment
Andreas Herwig and Dirk Konietzka (2012)	Zwischen Integration und Ausschluss. Die Klassenpositionen von Migranten im Zeit- und Generationenvergleich	Mikrozensus (1976, 2008)	employment, occupational status	migration status, migrant generation, country/region of origin, level of education/vocational training	natives vs migrant groups (Turkey, other guest worker countries, rest of world) and generation, separate models for males and females	males / females	1st & 2nd	- Between 1976 and 2008, the chances of Turkish men and women entering employment has sunken relative to natives (though more sharply for men than women) - Migrants without a high school diploma or vocational training have the same chances of finding employment as

								natives with the same educational qualifications - Second generation immigrants from guest-worker recruitment countries other than Turkey turn out to have similar chances of entering employment as natives, while other country of origin groups are still disadvantaged - Regressions for occupational status show that Turks do not differ substantially from other former guest-work recruitment countries in their occupational attainment
Agnieszka Kanas, Barry R. Chiswick, Tanja van der Lippe and Frank van Tubergen (2012)	Social Contacts and the Economic Performance of Immigrants: A Panel Study of Immigrants in Germany	SOEP (1984-2004)	occupational status, earnings	frequency of contacts, volunteering activity, contacts with Germans, partner's country of birth, ethnic concentration in region of residence, education in Germany, German proficiency, education abroad, work experience, years since migration, weekly working hours, doctor visits, country/region of origin	migrant group comparison (Turkey, Greece, Yugoslavia, Italy, Spain, Eastern Europe, other)	males	1st	- Migrants with more social contacts have better economic outcomes - Bridging social contacts with German natives especially appear to positively impact occupational status and annual income
Bram Lancee and Anne Hartung (2012)	Turkish Migrants and Native Germans Compared: The Effects of Inter-Ethnic and Intra-Ethnic Friendships on the Transition from Unemployment to Work	SOEP (1996-2007)	duration of unemployment	inter-ethnic friendships, intra-ethnic friendships, age, years of work experience, German proficiency, duration of stay in Germany, gender, educational attainment	natives vs. Turkish migrants	males / females	1st	- Only friendships with German natives facilitate the transition to employment, particularly for Turkish migrants - The effect is largest for migrants with a low level of education

Max Friedrich Steinhardt (2012)	Does citizenship matter? The economic impact of naturalizations in Germany	IAB employment sample (1975-2004)	mean daily wage	naturalisation, education, age, occupational status, economic sector, region of residence	migrant group comparison (naturalised vs non-naturalised migrants), separate regressions for men and women	males / females	1st	- There is a wage premium for naturalized women, but it is solely the result of a positive self-selection process
Anja Köbrich Leon (2013)	Does cultural heritage affect employment decisions: Empirical evidence for second generation immigrants in Germany	SOEP (2001-2011)	employment, weekly hours worked	female labour market participation in country of origin, age, years of education, German citizenship, marital status, partner's education level/income, presence of young children in the household, regional unemployment rate, years since migration, attitude towards housework, identification with Germany/home country, religious affiliation	migrant generations (separate models for first and second) and migrant groups (Turkey, Yugoslavia, Greece, Italy, Spain, Austria, France, UK, USA, Romania, Poland, Czech Republic, Russia, Kazakhstan, Belgium, Netherlands, Croatia, Bosnia-Herzegovina, Serbia)	females	1st & 2nd	- Female labour force participation rates in the home country, as proxies for cultural norms, are strongly negatively related to first generation female labour market behaviour, but had not statistically significant effect for the second generation - Religious identity is important for the labour market behaviour of both first and second generation migrant women, with Islam especially having a negative association to employment and hours of work
Irena Kogan and Markus Weißmann (2013)	Immigrants' initial steps in Germany and their later economic success	Labor Market Integration: Aussiedler and Jewish Immigrants from the Former Soviet Union in Germany and Israel (2007)	labour market trajectory (occupational status, earnings)	level of education in FSU, qualification recognition in Germany, occupational status of job before migration, German proficiency, contacts in Germany before migration, migrant group, gender, marital status, age at migration	migrant group comparison (Ethnic Germans, Jewish quota refugees)	males / females	1st	- Immigrants who initially enter lower status jobs after migration have difficulties improving their occupational status over time - Investing in host country language skills and education pays off in higher status occupations - Female migrants pursue occupations of lower status and earn lower wages than their male counterparts
Jutta Höhne and Fenella Fleischmann (2013)	Gender and migration on the labor market: Additive or interacting disadvantages in Germany?	Mikrozensus (2009)	labour force participation, part-time employment and occupational status	gender, country/region of origin, migrant generation, marital status, presence/age of children in household,	natives vs migrant groups (21 different origin countries) and migrant generation	males / females	1st & 2nd	- A large gender gap (high LFP for men, and low LFP for women) is found among first generation immigrants from North Africa, the Middle East, Turkey, South/Southeast

participation in education, level of education, length of stay in Germany

Asia, Italy, Poland
 - The gender gap in labor force participation is smaller for immigrants from the former Soviet Union and Greece compared to native West Germans
 - Part-time work is less prevalent among ethnic minority women compared to native West German women
 - Both first and second generation immigrants appear disadvantaged in their occupational attainment compared to native West Germans, with males comparably disadvantaged as females

Boris Hirsch, Elke Jahn, Ott Toomet, Daniela Hochfellner (2014)	Do better pre-migration skills accelerate immigrants' wage assimilation?	BASiD (2007)	earnings	country/region of origin, years since migration, migration cohort, age, skill level	natives vs. Ethnic German groups (Poland, Romania, former Soviet Union)	males	1st	<p>- There is a sizeable initial wage penalty for immigrants relative to natives, which closes substantially over the first 15 years in Germany</p> <p>- Evidence of partial transferability of pre-migration skills to the German labour market</p> <p>- Migrants with higher wage potential at the time of migration end up with a higher wage in Germany and experience faster wage assimilation than those with a lower wage potential</p>
Frank Kalter and Irena Kogan (2014)	Migrant Networks and Labor Market Integration of Immigrants from the Former Soviet Union in Germany	Labor Market Integration: Aussiedler and Jewish Immigrants from the Former Soviet Union in Germany and Israel (2007)	employment	friends in Germany before migration, migrant group, education level, occupational status before migration, German proficiency, age at arrival, gender, marital	migrant group comparison (Ethnic Germans, Jewish quota refugees)	males / females	1st	<p>- Social ties in Germany prior to migration does decrease the job search period, but only for low positions in the labour market</p> <p>- Social networks are even more important for Jewish immigrants compared to</p>

				status at migration, years since migration, personality traits				Ethnic Germans, since they do not received the same level of integration support - Younger immigrants with higher educational qualifications, better jobs prior to migration and better knowledge of German have easier access to jobs with higher occupational status in Germany
Olga Nottmeyer (2014)	Relative labor supply in intermarriage	SOEP (1997, 1999, 2001, 2003, 2005)	degree of household specialization	intermarriage, level of education, age, duration of marriage, children younger than 16, Muslim religiosity, German language proficiency, home country language proficiency	inter-ethnic couples (migrants married to natives) vs intra-ethnic couples (migrants married to migrants), separate regressions for men/women	males / females	1st & 2nd	- Likelihood of complete household specialization decreases for women in intermarried couples - Older women tend to live in more specialized households than younger women - Having children in the household or having Muslim religious affiliation also increase likelihood of living in a fully-specialized household - Migrants are pushed into self-employment if they feel discriminated - Accounting for other factors, the earnings of self-employed migrants are not significant
Arne Uhlendorff and Klaus F. Zimmermann (2014)	Unemployment Dynamics among Migrants and Natives	SOEP (1984-2004)	labour market trajectory (duration of unemployment, employment)	migrant generation, country/region of origin, year of migration, age, marital status, children under 4, children between 4 and 15, level of education, disability, local unemployment rate, previous unemployment duration	natives vs migrant groups (Turkey, Italy, Greece, Spain, Yugoslavia) and first vs. second generation	males	1st & 2nd	- Male migrants remained unemployed longer than natives - Turkish males have lower probability of leaving unemployment for paid job, while all other ethnic groups do not differ from natives in their probability (which is still observed in the second generation) - Employment stability, once a job is found, does not significantly differ

								between migrants and natives
Jutta Höhne and Karin Schulze Buschoff (2015)	Die Arbeitsmarktintegration von Migranten und Migrantinnen in Deutschland. Ein Überblick nach Herkunftsländern und Generationen	Mikrozensus (2012)	unemployment, occupational status, involuntary part-time work, work contract type, agency work	migrant status, migrant generation, country/region of origin, age, marital status, age of youngest child in household, region of residence, work experience, level of education (domestic, foreign), time of migration (pre/post 2007)	natives vs migrant groups (Turkey, former Yugoslavia, Southern EU, Eastern EU, North/West Europe, other), separate models for men and women	males / females	1st & 2nd	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Migrants are disadvantaged across all outcomes compared to natives with similar levels of education - Turkish migrants from both the first and second generation are especially disadvantaged, compared to all other origin groups - Migrants from North/West Europe have similar likelihoods of unemployment and occupational attainment as native Germans
Rene Leicht, Stefan Berwing, Marc Langhauser (2015)	Heterogenität und soziale Position migrantischer Selbständigkeit in Deutschland	Mikrozensus (2011)	earnings (from self-employment)	country/region of origin, gender, age, level of education, working hours, age of company, sector	natives vs migrant groups (guest workers, Eastern Europe, western industrialised countries, Asia)	males / females	1st & 2nd	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Level of education and business experience have similar positive effects on the income of both native and migrant entrepreneurs - The sector of activity also has a clear impact on income - those working in knowledge-intensive fields have higher earnings than those in food service fields - In comparison to native Germans, migrant entrepreneurs from Eastern Europe and Asia have particularly lower incomes
Agnese Romiti, Parvati Trübswetter, Ehsan Vallizadeh (2015)	Das soziale Umfeld gibt die Richtung vor	SOEP Migration Sample (time period unclear)	earnings	education level pre-migration, German proficiency pre-migration, gender, age, country/region of origin, work experience in Germany, regional labour market conditions, year of migration, year and region fixed effects	natives vs migrant groups (Western Europe, Eastern Europe, Turkey, Southern Europe, Asia and the Middle East, former Soviet states, Central and South America)	males / females	1st	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Ethnic networks can have different impacts on the labour market outcomes of migrants depending on their education level - Migrant women benefit especially from being in a highly educated ethnic environment, with salaries that raise much faster than their male counterparts

Jutta Höhne (2016)	Migrantinnen und Migranten auf dem deutschen Arbeitsmarkt	Mikrozensus (2005, 2013)	employment, unemployment, occupational status	survey year, migration background, level of education, age, marital status, age of youngest child in household, region of residence, education level abroad, migration date before 2008, young professional	natives vs migrant groups (North and Western Europe, Southern Europe, Eastern Europe, Turkey, other origin) and first vs second generation (for Turkey and Southern Europe) separate analyses for males/females	males / females	1st & 2nd	- The labour market integration of migrants in Germany has improved between the year 2005 and 2013, with lower unemployment rates and less distinct outcomes compared to natives - EU migrants differ little from natives in their labour market outcomes, but this is not the case for migrants from third countries
Matthias Koenig, Mieke Maliepaard, Ayse Güveli (2016)	Religion and new immigrants' labor market entry in Western Europe	SCIP (2010-2011)	employment, occupational status	religious affiliation, religious service attendance, migration motive, education level, work experience in the home country, German proficiency, number of inter-ethnic friends, length of stay in Germany	cross-national comparison (Germany, Netherlands, Great Britain), Muslims vs Christians	males / females	1st	- Religious participation neither hinders newcomers from finding jobs nor channels them into ethnic niche markets - Employment gap persists between Christians and Muslims in all three countries
Gabriele Ballarino and Nazareno Panichella (2017)	The occupational integration of migrant women in Western European labour markets	EU LFS (2005-2012)	employment, occupational status	migrant status, level of education, age, marital status, number of children, region of residence, presence of relative in household, migration pattern (tied, independent, joint etc.), husband's occupational status	natives (by EU country) vs migrants from 1) North America/Australia, 2) EU15, 3) Eastern Europe, 4) Africa/Asia/Latin America	females	1st	- Migrant employment penalties are lower in Mediterranean countries, but occupational segregation is severe - Tied migrants more disadvantaged than natives and independent movers
Herbert Brücker, Albrecht Glitz, Adrian Lerche and Agnese Romiti (2018)	Occupational Recognition and Immigrant Labor Market Outcomes	SOEP Migration Sample (2013-2015)	employment, earnings, occupation	application period, received recognition, years since migration, age, education level, gender, arrival cohort, German proficiency	migrant group comparison (applied for occupational recognition vs did not apply)	males / females	1st	- Migrants benefit substantially from occupational recognition, with gains in both employment and wages - Migrants who receive occupational recognition have a 24.5 percentage point higher employment rate and a 19.8 percent higher hourly wage three years after receiving

								recognition, compared to migrants who do not apply - Occupational recognition induces workers to enter regulated occupations in Germany
Christina Gathmann and Nicolas Keller (2018)	Access to Citizenship and the Economic Assimilation of Immigrants	Mikrozensus (waves 2005-2010)	log monthly personal income, employment	residency requirement, year of birth, year of arrival, number of years in Germany, country/region of origin (EU-15, recent EU states, ex-Yugoslavia, Turkey, former Soviet Union, Asia, Africa, Middle East, North America, South America)	migrants group comparison (cohorts before changes to naturalisation laws vs later cohorts), separate regressions for men and women	males / females	1st	- Naturalization is associated with higher employment rates (5.9 percentage points for women, 1.7 for men) - Naturalization is also associated with higher labor market income (0.118 log points for women, 0.104 for men) for women, shorter residency requirements increase employment by 0.5%
Veronika J. Knize Estrada (2018)	Migrant women labor-force participation in Germany: Human capital, segmented labor market and gender perspectives	SOEP Migration Sample (2013)	employed, working hours	education abroad, education in Germany, further education (vocational training or tertiary education), age, years since migration, German proficiency, migration motive, health, marital status, children under 6 years old, children between 6 and 17, migrant generation, country/region of origin, qualification recognition, perceptions of disadvantage, religious affiliation, frequency of praying	migrant group comparison (Western Europe, Eastern Europe, Ethnic Germans, North Africa/Middle East, other), and first vs second generation	females	1st & 2nd	- Taking into account all covariates, second (and third) generation migrants have the best chances of being employed, along with first generation migrants from Western Europe - Recognition of qualifications is especially important for women from Western and Eastern Europe, while it doesn't affect the labor participation probability of female migrants from other regions - In comparison to having no religious affiliation, Islamic religiosity reduces the probability of working, while being Christian raises the probability - Higher frequency of praying also reduces the probability of being employed - Further investigation in

								migrants' labour participation attempting to examine economic exclusion or discrimination should reflect employers' attitudes and migrant's choices about working
Eric Schuss (2018)	The Impact of Language Skills on Immigrants' Labor Market Integration: A Brief Revision With a New Approach	SOEP Migration Sample (2013-2015)	earnings	German proficiency, language skills at arrival, age, age at arrival, years of residence, German citizenship, marital status, remittances sent to home country, job search channel, EU national, level of education, German education, work experience in home country, occupational status in home country, current residency status in Germany	migrants, separate models for males/females	males / females	1st	- German proficiency is a strong predictor for higher labour market income for both male and female migrants, but mostly for migrants with middle and high human capital - Income improves with duration of residence, though ethnic networks are not significantly correlated with higher incomes
Jystyna Stypinska and Laura Romeu Gordo (2018)	Gender, age and migration: an intersectional approach to inequalities in the labour market	SOEP (1991-2004)	hourly wage	gender, age, level of education, work experience, migration background, region of residence, health, number of children in the household, marital status, total income of partner, number of hours of household work by partner	natives vs migrants	males / females	1st	- Even after controlling for the main wage determinants, women are earning less at younger ages, though there is no significant effect of migration background - People with a migration background earn on average 4% less than non-migrants do, and differences increase with age
Marie Wälde and Katalin Evers (2018)	Arbeitsmarktintegration von Zuwanderern im Familiennachzug	BAMF Familiennachzugstudie (2016)	employment, occupational status	gender, age, year of arrival, intended duration of stay, number of children, partner in household, education level obtained abroad, education in Germany, German	male vs. female migrants	males / females	1st	- Gender is an important determinant of labour market participation, with men showing a 30 percentage point higher likelihood of working than women - A migrant's duration of stay has a positive and significant effect on

				proficiency, work experience before migration, country/region of origin				working habits, but this is stronger for men than for women - Foreign educational qualifications have no impact on the probability of being employed - The employment status in the year before migration is especially relevant for labour market participation after migration - Education/vocational training in Germany has a positive impact on occupational status for both men and women, as does German language skills
Magdalena Krieger (2019)	Tied and Troubled: Revisiting Tied Migration and Subsequent Employment	SOEP (2013, 2015)	employment, time to first employment after migration	migrant type (tied/lead/equal), age, children under 18, German proficiency, level of education, period of immigration, country/region of origin	migrant types (tied/lead/equal movers)	males / females	1st	- There are no significant differences in the employment probability between female tied, lead or 'equal' movers, though lead female migrants enter the labor market earlier than the others
Martin Wroble (2019)	Determinants of successful labour market integration as exemplified by the German Green Card programme	Integrated employment biographies of Green card recipients from BA and IAB (2000-2010)	labour market trajectory (employment)	gender, age, nationality, residence in Germany at start of Green Card Program, type of occupation, wage, sector of employment, size of firm	migrant cluster (determined by sequence/cluster analysis)	males / females	1st	- There is a high probability of migrants successfully integrating into German society who work at a larger firm, earn a moderate wage, have a more technically oriented occupation, and come from Central or Eastern Europe
Zerrin Salikutluk, Johannes Giesecke and Martin Kroh (2020)	The Situation of Female Immigrants on the German Labour Market: A Multi-Perspective Approach	SOEP (2013, 2015)	employment, occupational status, hourly wages	country/region of origin, gender, educational qualifications, work experience, German proficiency, number of home visits, job industry, level of autonomy at job,	natives vs migrant groups (Turkey, former Soviet Union)	males / females	1st & 2nd	- The disadvantage of immigrant women seems to be mainly based on compositional differences in formal qualifications and work experience - Ethnic differences in occupational status for both genders are on a

type of employment
(full-time/part-time),
firm size,
overqualified for job,
age, region of
residence, marital
status, number of
children under six,
year of survey

similar level, suggesting
that immigrant women are
not particularly
disadvantaged on this
indicator
- There is a clear hierarchy
of hourly wages, with first
generation Turkish women
at the bottom